

City of Modesto - Audit Recommendations Tracking Report
4/15/2025

	(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)
Reports	Total Recommendations	Open Recommendations (Not Yet Completed by City)	Validated Recommendations (By Moss Adams)	Reportable Recommendations (Newly validated since last summary)
Single Audit Report - 2017 (17-SAR)	4	0	4	0
Single Audit Report - 2018 (18-SAR)	3	0	3	0
Single Audit Report - 2019 (19-SAR)	1	0	1	0
Single Audit Report - 2020 (20-SAR)	1	0	1	0
Single Audit Report - 2021 (21-SAR)	1	0	1	0
2018-2019 Stanislaus County Civil Grand Jury (18_19-SCCGJ)	8	0	8	0
2022-2023 Stanislaus County Civil Grand Jury Final Report (22_23-SCCGJ)	5	0	5	0
2021-2022 Stanislaus County Civil Grand Jury Final Report (21_22-SCCGJ)	7	0	7	0
2024- FORESTRY AND SOLID WASTE EFFICIENCY STUDY UPDATE (24-FASWES)	20	14	6	0
2024- PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE AUDIT (24-PPA)	11	11	0	0
2016- Solid Waste Efficiency Study (16-SWES)	12	4	8	0
2016-WATER AND WASTEWATER EFFICIENCY STUDY UPDATE (16-WWE)	14	3	11	1
2017- BILLING AND ACCOUNTS RECEIVABLE REVIEW (17-BAR)	4	0	4	4
2017- FLEET SERVICES EFFICIENCY STUDY (17-FSE)	27	5	22	0
2017- INTERNAL CONTROLS TESTING: PROCUREMENTCARDS (17-ICTPC)	19	1	18	1
2017-INTERNAL CONTROLS TESTING: TRAVEL EXPENSES (17-ICTTE)	17	0	17	0
2017- INTERNAL SERVICE FUND REVIEW (17-ISF)	18	11	7	1
2018- Fleet Utilization Study (18-FUS)	13	8	5	0
2018- PERMITTING EFFICIENCY STUDY (18-PES)	10	0	10	3
2016 INTERNAL CONTROLS TESTING: CASH HANDLING (16-ICTCH)	42	2	40	0
	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0
Total	237	59	178	10

Legend:

Total Recommendations = number of recommendations in the report

Open Recommendations = number of recommendations not yet completed by City

Validated Recommendations = number of recommendations validated by Moss Adams as completed and adequately addresses the finding

Reportable Recommendations = number of recommendations validated since last summary report for Audit Committee

ID	Finding Number from Report	Report Year	Report Code	Finding	Recommendation	Moss Adams Determination Notes
73	12A	2016	16-WWE	Pay grades for most Water and Wastewater positions are lower than neighboring cities.	Review compensation and benefits for Water and Wastewater positions and consider adjusting compensation accordingly.	most recent class/comp study for utilities was provided and dated 2023 Final.
75	1	2017	17-BAR	Community and Economic Development (CED) Department billing procedure documents have not been updated within the last four years.	Review and update departmental billing procedures, and institute an annual or biennial review process.	Permit Accounting Procedures were provided and have an approval data of 8/1/2024. The city reports that the procedure will be reviewed and updated annually.
76	2	2017	17-BAR	The Risk Management claims settlement process is inefficient.	Establish and document claims settlement procedures.	Claims Settlement documentations was provided. Broken up in to two section. A process for Under 50K non-litigated and a process for those litigated.
77	1	2017	17-BAR	Risk management claims are tracked on an Excel spreadsheet, which results in process inefficiencies and presents a risk of error.	Consider implementing a claims management system.	City provided the vendor contract with the the TPA, George Hills Company. That agrrement was approved by Council on May 25, 2021
78	2	2017	17-BAR	Billing activities are performed outside of the Oracle ERP system.	Investigate possibilities to integrate the billing process into Oracle.	Permit Accounting Procedures were provided and have an approval data of 8/1/2024. Based on the procedures provided there is an integration with GL and Oracle
132	10	2017	17-ICTPC	Although the City performs P-Card audits each month, the current approach may not be the most efficient or effective.	Modify current P-Card audits to provide more timely and robust oversight.	Provided April, May and June 2024 P card Audit logs. They list every cardholder by name, mark if it was reviewed with no concern. If there is needed justification that information is provided along with the Pcard #
158	17	2033	17-ISF	N/A	Continue to adequately fund the Mail ISF. Consider changing the funding formula to better match current utilization levels.	We reviewed the Mail Service ISF provided, Dated FY24/25 and calculations seem to match utilizations numbers.
178	6	2018	18-PES	Inconsistent and Outdated Policy and Procedure Documentation	Strengthen policies and procedures, cross-training, and workforce planning; prioritize the documentation of policies and procedures related to the various permitting processes, updating outdated policies and documenting previously uncaptured processes, and identifying key personnel.	the City provided all the permitting related policies and procedures. Ther were revised as of 10/7/24. Policies and Procedures cover topis around Accoutning and permitting, Buildign Safety, Board of Buildign Appeals, Rental Housing Safety Program and Vacant Property Registrations.
180	8	2018	18-PES	Negative Impacts to Customer Service at Development Services Center	Reevaluate how the Development Services Center reception counter is staffed, and provide training on customer service expectations and permitting activity processes.	MOU of the receptionist position was provided and was signed in oct 2020. The city also provided a list of all the trainings received by the reception staff between Jan and Nov 2024. Training topics include: ADA Parking; COD/RCOD Mailings; TCO Processing; New Notice and Order Procedure; All Gender Restrooms; Mobilehomes on permanent foundations; New Deposit Permit Reports; Locking Parcels; TCO Procedures; Romex Wiring; Historic Parcels; New Inspector Onboarding; Soft Skills for Building Safety Staff; Inspection Conditions
181	9	2018	18-PES	Lack Capacity for Environmental and Stormwater Related Permitting Activities.	Prioritize appropriately resourcing and staffing the positions required to safely and efficiently conduct the environmental and stormwater requirements for permitting activities.	The KPIs provided for all of 2024 showed that the environmental and stormwater plan checks are occurring timely and they were continually being tracked and monitored